

**From:** [Sinclair, Fiona](#)  
**To:** ["Graham Layer"](#)  
**Subject:** FW: Weekend Press Coverage  
**Date:** 27 May 2014 12:29:00  
**Attachments:** [Suspended Fellow Prof Eljamel - The Herald - 20 May 2014.pdf](#)  
[Sacked Fellow Roger Bainton - Scottish Daily Express - 17 May 2014.pdf](#)  
[Surgeons Hall Museum Festival - The Herald - 17 May 2014.pdf](#)

---

Graham

Hope all is well with you.

Please see that attached;

Muftah Salem Eljamel: Was awarded a Fellowship without Examination on 28 February 2003. He is in good standing.

Roger Bainton: Is a retired Fellow of this College. Retired since 2005.

Cheers

Fiona

**Fiona Sinclair**

Membership Manager

Membership and Communications Department

The Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh

Nicolson Street, Edinburgh EH8 9DW

Direct T: [REDACTED] CAT C

Fax: [REDACTED] CAT C

[REDACTED] CAT C

[www.rcsed.ac.uk](http://www.rcsed.ac.uk)

---

**From:** O'Sullivan, Aoife

**Sent:** 20 May 2014 09:25

**To:** presidentpa; Allen, Sarah; Baillie, Mark

**Cc:** Rooney, Alison; MacInnes, Callum; Library Department; Sinclair, Fiona

**Subject:** Weekend Press Coverage

Please see attached.

Kind regards,

Aoife

**Aoife O'Sullivan**

Marketing & Communications Officer

The Royal College of Surgeons of Edinburgh

Nicolson Street

Edinburgh

EH8 9DW

Tel: [REDACTED] CAT C

Email: [REDACTED] CAT C

# Surgeon suspended over claim of error in operation

Professor also steps down from teaching as GMC investigates

## NIAMH BURNS

ONE of Scotland's most respected surgeons has been suspended amid claims he was involved in an operation in which a procedure was carried out on the wrong spinal disc of a patient.

Consultant neurosurgeon Professor Muftah Salem Eljamel has also stepped down from his teaching and research posts at Dundee University.

Mr Eljamel, 57, has taught medical students at the university and worked in the neurological department of the city's Ninewells Hospital for more than a decade.

But he was subjected to an interim order by the Medical Practitioners Tribunal Service in February where restrictions were put on his licence.

The order means the doctor is currently unable to carry out spinal surgery and he cannot complete

private practice work, which he had been doing until last year.

He also must inform the General Medical Council (GMC) if he applies

for work outside the UK, and must allow the body to "exchange information with his employer or any contracting body for which he provides medical services".

Mr Eljamel had previously taught medical students in a number of disciplines, which included clinical spinal and cranial neurosurgery.

He also held a position as a consultant at private hospital Fernbrae, run by BMI Healthcare, from which he has since stepped down.

It is understood concerns were raised about his conduct last year, before the decision to put an Interim Order – which lasts up to 18 months – was put in place.

An interim order panel hearing looks at whether a doctor's registration should be restricted while

allegations about their conduct are resolved, where it could be in the interest of the public, or the doctor.

A spokeswoman for NHS Tayside said: "We are aware of the restrictions imposed by the GMC on this consultant. We are unable to comment on matters relating to individual staff."

But it is believed Mr Eljamel has been suspended from his position on the hospital's neurological team while an investigation is carried out by the GMC.

Margaret Watt, of the Scottish Patients Association, said: "We support the decision taken to investigate this doctor. We would hope that following a decision he would be sent for retraining or provided with any supervision should he need it."

A spokesman for Dundee University said: "We are aware of



the restrictions placed on Professor Eljamel, and he has not carried out any teaching at the university since late 2013."

Research previously undertaken at the university by the professor includes work looking at intracranial tumours, and he has also been published with writing on functional, psychosurgery, epilepsy and movement disorders.

Professor Eljamel refused to comment at his home in Newport-On-Tay.

He graduated from Al Fateh University in 1982 and has been a consultant neurological surgeon in NHS Tayside since 1995. He is also a member of the Royal College Of Surgeons Of Edinburgh.

While working for Fernbrae Hospital, Mr Eljamel carried out range of procedures including spinal and brain surgery.

Last year it was revealed that brain surgeon Wlodzimierz Szepielow, who also worked at Ninewells Hospital, was removed from his post after he scored a record low of 17.5 per cent in a surgical exam.

“

**We support this investigation. We would hope that following a decision he would be sent for retraining or provided with any supervision should he need it**





**PROFESSOR ELJAMEL:** Has worked in the neurological department of the Ninewells Hospital, Dundee, for more than a decade.

Ref: 85831133



# Sacked surgeon in new probe

## Medic blamed patients for 'experimental' op problems

By **Brian Swanson**

A SURGEON reprimanded by watchdogs after the death of a Scots patient has been suspended amid concerns about the care of more than 80 people.

Roger Bainton was sacked as maxillofacial consultant at Aberdeen Royal Infirmary 14 years ago after the General Medical Council found him guilty of professional misconduct.

It followed a series of blunders in an operation which left Iain Duncan, an Aberdeen bus driver, in a "persistent vegetative state" before his death.

Mr Duncan, 32, of Bridge of Don, died in November 1995, six months after he suffered irreversible brain damage following surgery to his jaw.

Mr Bainton is being investigated again after concerns were raised over the treatment of 88 patients at the University Hospital of North Staffordshire. He was suspended in February last year amid claims he carried out unnecessary operations or procedures which were not fully regulated. Yesterday it emerged he has blamed patients for "smoking, drinking and taking drugs" after some of the operations went wrong.

He made the claim to investigators quizzing him on why 26 per cent of his operations for a particular facial fracture failed – against the normal complication rate of three per cent.

Mr Bainton also claimed the patients had a weaker genetic make-up, leading to more surgery mix-ups.

But a leaked Royal College of Surgeons (RCS) report said: "The review team did not agree with this statement and considered it demonstrated a lack of reflection and insight into the complications." It is claimed he used an unproven and experimental bone substitute without personally telling his patients in 33 of 123 procedures.

He allegedly started implanting the

material into the eye sockets of the patients at the hospital in 2007.

The technique had only previously been used on non-facial bones. But it was stopped in 2012 after colleagues reported their concerns.

The RCS report found: "He tended to rationalise poor patient outcomes and repeated procedures as being the result of the patient's own lifestyle. There is now a legacy of patients who have had unproven surgical techniques applied to their care without adequate consent and who will likely require long-term follow-ups."

Lawyer Karen Reynolds, of Freeth Cartwright LLP, representing 30 of Mr Bainton's patients, said: "The RCS report indicates significant failings, not only in Mr Bainton's practice, but within the maxillofacial department and the hospital trust itself."

Hospital officials apologised to patients who may have been harmed during or following facial surgery.

Medical director Robert Courteney-Harris said: "We have been committed from the outset to being open and transparent with our patients, regulatory bodies and commissioners. Our priority is to ensure our patients are able to have full confidence in the quality of care and treatment they receive from us and that any departure from these high standards is thoroughly investigated and acted upon."

Mr Bainton was unavailable for comment.



Consultant Roger Bainton

Ref: 85738988



## New director builds Festival excitement



**KEITH  
BRUCE**

**Y**ou may have read a report by Phil Miller in our news pages of an informal briefing by the director designate of the Edinburgh International Festival, Fergus Linehan, in the Dunard Library of The Hub, EIF's HQ. It was a small event, but it presaged some interesting changes.

Each Festival director has his own way of doing things (Linehan will be the fifth whose Festivals I have covered) and his predecessors – John Drummond, Frank Dunlop, Brian McMaster and Jonathan Mills – could hardly be more diverse characters.

Linehan, in white shirt and charcoal suit, sat at the centre of a semi-circle of journalists, with a quarto-size moleskin notebook of meticulous handwriting on his knee.

The Irishman opened by likening the set-up to a meeting of Alcoholics Anonymous – a gag that would have got a bigger laugh in Scotland 30 years

ago, tellingly; it also felt a little like a briefing from the EIF's press adviser back then, when the Festival director would not have descended to such an intimacy with the press.

The new man was at ease, but chose his words carefully, as he outlined his history of involvement in the Festival, including a reference to co-producing the Catalan director Calixto Bieito's controversial *Barbaric Comedies* that was suffixed with the Beckettian comment: "If you are going to fail, fail big."

That mis-hit has clearly not put him off. The enticing prospect of a theatre man being at the helm of the event for the first time since Dunlop was enhanced by his stated determination to include "theatre of a scale to match the rest of the programme" and the announcement of a co-production of *Antigone*, starring Juliet Binoche and directed by Ivo van Hove, who won a Herald Angel in 1999, the year of his last association with Edinburgh with a production of *India Song* by Marguerite Duras.

It was one of a trio of revelations about the 2015 Festival that knocked the event's usual embargo on its programme details into touch, the

other two being *The Marriage Of Figaro*, in a semi-staged production by Ivan Fischer and the Budapest Festival Orchestra (who first won an Angel in 1997 with Fischer collecting an Archangel in 2012) and a celebration of the 50th anniversary of the founding of the Edinburgh Festival Chorus.

Linehan's other big news was the moving of the Festival dates to re-align with the Fringe, to give the audience the "entire spectrum" of the arts during three weeks in August, and his intention to extend the musical remit of the EIF in to other genres, while remaining as "advocate and evangelist for classical music".

If his intention was to build excitement for his first year, even as we gear up for his predecessor's final hurrah, the gambit worked.

This weekend the build-up to the 2014 event continues with pop-up performances at Surgeon's Hall and the Scottish National Gallery of art songs linked to the Festival's marking of the centenary of the First World War (see [eif.co.uk/artsong](http://eif.co.uk/artsong) for details). Edinburgh, it seems, will not be overshadowed by Glasgow's summer schedule.

